

SCOTTISH BORDERS COUNCIL CHILDREN AND YOUNG PEOPLE'S SERVICES OPTIONS APPRAISAL REPORT



ETTRICK PRIMARY SCHOOL

1. INTRODUCTION

The Council have a statutory duty in terms of the Education (Scotland) Act 1980 to make adequate and efficient provision of school education across the entire area for the current school population and the future pattern of demand. Councils also have a statutory responsibility in terms of the Local Government (Scotland) Act 2003 to achieve best value. The Council requires to review its school estate on an ongoing basis to ensure these requirements are achieved.

In 2009 the Scottish Government set out its vision for the Future School Estate in Scotland, in 'Building Better Schools: Investing in Scotland's Future'. Local Authorities are required to take account of these aspirations in planning changes to their school estate, namely:

- All children and young people will be educated in, and community users will use, schools that are 'fit for purpose' in terms of condition, suitability and sufficiency;
- Schools are well-designed, accessible, inclusive learning environments that inspire and drive new thinking and change and which support the delivery of high quality educational experiences through Curriculum for Excellence;
- Schools are integral parts of the communities they serve, with pupils making use of community facilities and communities accessing school facilities;
- Schools accommodate and provide a range of services, activities and facilities that make a difference to people's health and well-being, to sustaining economic growth and to the strength and vibrancy of communities;
- A sustainable school estate whose design, construction and operation is environmentally and energy efficient; contributes directly to delivering the year-on-year reductions in greenhouse gas emissions introduced by The Climate Change (Scotland) Act 2009, which is resilient to the impact of climate change and which leads by example in matters of environmental performance;
- A school estate that is efficiently run and that maximises value for money;
- A school estate which is flexible and responsive both to changes in demand for school places and to learners' and teachers' requirements and wishes, and where the beneficial impact of change is maximised by thorough consultation and engagement with users and stakeholders.

The Scottish Borders Council Executive (Education) Committee on 20 January 2015 agreed principles to guide a review of the school estate to ensure that a strategic approach is taken whilst delivering:

- (a) increased education opportunities;
- (b) improved outcomes for children and young people;
- (c) sustainability;
- (d) a future-proof school estate; and
- (e) affordability.

The Council's Executive (Education) Committee in February 2016 agreed to commence consultation regarding current school estate provision and what the future school estate school provision should aspire to look like. As part of this on-going review, the Council requires to consider schools that have currently been mothballed and whether they should be closed.

2 BACKGROUND

2.1 History

Ettrick Primary School, Ettrick Valley, Selkirk is a non-denominational primary school that has been designated as a rural school by the Scottish Government. It opened in 1965 and the school had capacity for 50 pupils. Ettrick Primary shared a Headteacher with 2 partner schools, namely Yarrow and Kirkhope.

In 2007 there were eleven pupils but by 2011 this had reduced to three pupils. With two pupils due to transfer to High School from August 2012 there was only going to be one pupil remaining for school session 2012/2013. This amounted to an occupancy level of 2%. The running cost of the school with one pupil would be £113,000 per year. The one pupil that would have remained at the school for session 2012/2013 made a placing request in March 2012 to move to Kirkhope Primary School, which was granted.

Given the considerable drop in the school roll the Council recognised that Ettrick Primary School was becoming at risk, with an operating cost of £113,000 (if only one pupil remained) compared to an average cost per pupil of under £4,000 in the Scottish Borders. Given the school capacity of 50 pupils occupancy would have been at only 2%.

Support was given at that time to the school and community to look at any alternatives to closure, including the suggestion to transfer pupils from one or the other of the partner schools to breathe life into the school for part of the week. In June 2012, the decision was taken to mothball Ettrick Primary School due to a lack of pupils and a commitment was given to undertake a statutory consultation on permanent closure if there continued to be no pupils enrolled in the school. At the point that Ettrick Primary School was mothballed the Cabinet Secretary of Education and Lifelong Learning had announced the setting up of a Commission for the Delivery of Rural Education and requested a moratorium on rural closures for one year. The moratorium was proposed to run from 20 June 2011 to 20 June 2012.

As a result of the recommendations made by the Commission for the Delivery of Rural Education, the Schools Consultation (Scotland) Act 2010 (the "2010 Act"), was amended by the Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014 (the "2014 Act"). These changes have now come into force.

The 2010 Act's principal purpose was to provide strong, accountable, statutory consultation practices and procedures that local authorities must apply to their handling of all proposals for school closures and other major changes to schools. These consultation processes are expected to be robust, open, transparent and fair, and seem to be so. They are also expected to be consistent across Scotland.

The 2010 Act makes special arrangement in regard to rural schools, establishing in effect a presumption against closure of rural schools. The result of this is that Educational Authorities must have special regard to a number of factors before formulating a proposal to close a rural school and then consulting on a mutual decision as to whether to implement a rural school closure proposal. The new duties are outlined in the 2010 Act and the accompanying statutory guidance.

2.2 Options Appraisal

The Council had initially undertaken that within three years of mothballing the school, in accordance with Scottish Government guidance, it would review whether the school would be closed. In light of the special arrangements in regard to rural schools now enshrined in the 2010 Act, a full options appraisal is required to consider all options available as well as closure. This options appraisal will enable the Council's Children and Young People's Services to determine whether closure is the most appropriate option and if so to thereafter commence statutory consultation on it.

2.3 Current Position

The summary position is as follows:

- Prior to the mothballing of Ettrick Primary School, the pupils from Ettrick Primary School catchment area worked with the other two schools (Yarrow and Kirkhope) through the shared headship arrangement.
- Following the mothballing of Ettrick Primary School, the pupils from Ettrick Primary School catchment area currently attend Kirkhope Primary School.
- Since the mothballing of Ettrick Primary School in 2012 there have been no enquiries made in relation to children enrolling at Ettrick Primary School.
- The 2010 Act makes special arrangements in regard to rural school rolls establishing in effect a presumption against closure of rural schools. There is a requirement to have special regard to the rural schools factors before formulating a proposal to closure a rural school. In particular it is necessary to consider any reasonable alternatives before considering closure. It is also necessary to consider the impact on the wider community of a potential closure and the impacts of any different travelling arrangements. These factors have been considered in this option appraisal.

3. CONTEXT

3.1 Story of Place/Community Profile

The catchment area for Ettrick Primary School sits within the Eildon area of the Scottish Borders which is the largest of the five Borders localities. This area covers a geographical area of approximately 124,557 hectares (1245 km²⁾. The Eildon area's main towns are Galashiels and Selkirk and the larger villages within it are Melrose, Tweedbank, Lauder, Earlston, Newtown St Boswells and Stow. It has three high schools Galashiels, Selkirk and Earlston. The Eildon area has 6,079 children aged 0-15 within it, making up 17.8% of the population.

The towns are home to 80% of Eildon's population and the locality is considered to be the economic hub of the Scottish Borders. However it also covers a large, scenic rural area populated by scattered small villages, of under 500 people such as Ettrick and Yarrow Feus, farms and hamlets. More detail about the Eildon area can be found in the Eildon Extract of the Scottish Borders Community Planning Partnership 2016 Strategic Assessment:

https://www.scotborders.gov.uk/downloads/file/2450/strategic_assessment_-_eildon_area

The Eildon area map can be viewed at:

https://www.scotborders.gov.uk/downloads/download/545/eildon_area_map

4. ETTRICK AND THE LOCAL AREA

4.1 Location of Schools

Ettrick Primary School and Kirkhope Primary School are situated in the Ettrick Valley of the Scottish Borders. Ettrick, also known as Hopehouse, where Ettrick Primary School is located is in the upland valley of Ettrick Water, approximately 17 miles south west of Selkirk on the B709 minor road. Ettrickbridge, where Kirkhope Primary School is located is also in the upland valley of Ettrick Water, approximately 7.3 miles south west of Selkirk on the B709 minor road. Lying to the south west of the Ettrick Valley is the town of Moffat within the Dumfries and Galloway Council area. To the north of the Ettrick Valley is the Yarrow Valley. Yarrow Primary School is located to the east of the hamlet of Yarrow Feus in the Yarrow valley, approximately 10.5 miles south west of Selkirk on the A708 road. Yarrow Primary School and Ettrick Primary School are linked by the B709 minor road and lie approximately 12.5 miles apart.

There are a number of building groups located in the Ettrick Valley, along the B709, including Ettrick, Hopehouse, Tushielaw, Crosslee and Ettrickbridge. The largest cluster of buildings are the settlements of Hopehouse and Ettrickbridge.

At Hopehouse, which straddles Hopehouse Burn, a tributary of the Ettrick Water, there is a church and village hall together with the prominent steading of Wardlaw and a number of small cottages and detached houses. There is also a small caravan park. It is set on a southerly aspect and sits in an attractive upland landscape and impressive views of the southern high hills.

Ettrickbridge is established by its main street from church to the village hall. In addition to Kirkhope Primary School the village also has a pub and sports club.

Yarrow Primary School serves the widely scattered rural community of the Yarrow Valley within which St. Mary's Loch is situated. There are a number of hamlets and small villages within Yarrow Valley and there are village halls at Yarrow Feus, Cappercleuch, and Yarrow Ford.

4.2 Distinct Village halls, separate from the school buildings, are available in respect of each of the areas served by Ettrick, Kirkhope and Yarrow Primary schools.

4.3 Population

For the purposes of this Options Appraisal the census output areas S00085889 and S00083857 were chosen because they were a good fit with the catchment areas of Ettrick Primary School, Kirkhope Primary School and Yarrow Primary School, as can be seen on the map below (N.B. This Map shows only two Primary School catchments as Ettrick Primary School and Kirkhope Primary School are shown as one combined temporary catchment post the mothballing of Ettrick Primary School).

FIGURE 1: ETTRICK PRIMARY SCHOOL CATCHMENT AREA AND CENSUS OUTPUT AREAS MAP.



These 2 census output areas have an area of 469.6 km^2 . In 2015 the population of the 2 census output areas was 1066 with 164 (15.38%) being aged 0 to 15. From 2001 to 2015 those of the population aged 0 to 15 in the combined area decreased by 108 people, with the area experiencing a total decrease in population numbers of 238 people.

4.4 Development and House Building

The SESplan Strategic Development Plan (SDP) provides high level strategic guidance and provides the context for the Local Development Plan (LDP), setting an overall housing requirement for the SESplan area. The LDP allocates a range of sites which are effective or expected to become effective in the plan period to meet the SESplan housing land requirement in full.

The housing land requirement across the Scottish Borders, up to the period 2030 is identified as 4,594 units within the proposed SDP 2016. It is considered that this figure can be met within the identified housing land supply within the adopted LDP 2016. The Council is required to keep the LDP up to date and review it at a maximum of five year intervals.

The Ettrick area falls within the Southern Housing Market Area, as identified within the LDP 2016. The LDP 2016 allocates 3 housing sites within Ettrick, namely: Hopehouse East, Hopehouse West and Hopehouse North East. Each of the allocated housing sites has an indicative site capacity of 5 units and only 1 unit has been completed to date. Due to Ettrick

lying within the Southern Housing Market Area a more flexible approach to supporting housing in the countryside proposals, outwith allocated sites, applies. However in practice the number of approvals implemented in terms of these provisions is very low.

The Housing Land Audit (HLA) 2015 programmes 7 units as being effective within the plan period up to 2021, with the remaining units programmed outwith the plan period. This has been informed using past completion rates and the lack of developer interest to date within Ettrick. If the housing development comes to fruition, the 14 units may equate to 4 additional pupils in total. This is based on the assumption that the planned housing is developed and those pupils choose to attend Ettrick Primary School. However, taking on board the programming contained within the HLA, the delivery of housing within Ettrick could be spread over several LDP periods.

In terms of potential new business ventures in the area, there have been no enquiries to the Council's Business Development Team/Economic Development Team. They have advised that there are unlikely to be any significant changes to the population relative to Ettrick Primary School catchment area as a result of business growth.

4.5 Pupil Numbers

The methodology used for pupil projection in this report allows us to project a detailed year by year analysis for each catchment. Information is based on pupil census data from each September of the academic year for the Scottish Borders. See Appendix 1 for further details.

The table below shows the historic, current, and projected pupil numbers for the schools detailed in this report should Ettrick remain mothballed or be closed.

4.6 Individual School Roll Pupil Numbers – Historic Data (Based on Census)

Primary	Capacity	2007/	2008/	2009/	2010/	2011/	2012/	2013/	2014/	2015/
School		2008	2009	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015	2016
Ettrick	50	11	8	6	4	3	0	0	0	0
Kirkhope	50	39	32	32	33	38	38 (1)	32 (1)	15 (1)	16 (1)
Yarrow	50	6	5	8	12	17	18	19	19	18

*Children transferred from Ettrick post mothballing stated in brackets.

4.7 Individual School Roll Pupil Numbers – Current and Projected

(2016/17 based on census 2016 including house building)

Primary School	Capacity	2016/	2017/	2018/	2019/	2020/
		2017	2018	2019	2020	2021
Kirkhope	50	17	12	11	10	8
Yarrow	50	14	13	8	8	7

5 ETTRICK PRIMARY SCHOOL

Ettrick Primary School is a non-denominational primary school serving the village of Hopehouse and the local area. The catchment area for the school covers an area of 14767 Hectares (147km2) and is detailed on the map below.



The Scottish Government's Rural School List 2015 classifies Ettrick Primary School as "Accessiblerural" school under Section 14 of the 2010 Act. The classification is based on two main criteria, settlement size and accessibility based on drive time. For Ettrick Primary School the classification criteria is "settlements of fewer than 3,000 people and within 30 minutes' drive of a settlement of 10,000 or more". (Source: Scottish Government Rural School List 2015.)

Ettrick Primary School and Kirkhope Primary School are both located in the 2011 based datazone S01012378, named Ettrick Water and Bowhill Area. This datazone is classified as a 5 (Accessible Rural) within the Scottish Governments 6 fold urban-rural classification. It has a SIMD2016 decile of 6.

The first table below, derived from National Records of Scotland data, shows the age group distribution for the datazone in which both primary schools are situated, and how it has changed between 2001 and 2015. In 2001 there were 154 children (aged 0 to 15) living in this area, which was 23% of the population. However by 2015 there were 61 children (aged 0 to 15) living in this area, which is 11% of the population.

Ettrick Water and	d Bowhill Area (S01012378)		
Year	Age Group	Population	Percent
	0 to 15	154	23%
2001 (best fit	16 to 64	431	64%
2001 COA to	65+	84	13%
DZ2011)	All people	669	100%
	0 to 15	76	13%
	16 to 64	371	66%
2011 Pop by	65+	119	21%
DZ2011	All people	566	100%
	0 to 15	61	11%
	16 to 64	347	63%
2015 Pop by	65+	144	26%
DZ2011	All people	552	100%

As can be seen from the second table below, also derived from National Records of Scotland data, in the period between 2011 and 2015 the number of children (aged 0 to 15) living in this area dropped by 15, representing a 20% decrease in the number of children in the area.

Ettrick Water and Bowhill Area (S01012378)			
	Change 2011 to 2015	Count	Percent
	0 to 15	-15	-20%
	16 to 64	-24	-6%
	65+	25	21%
	All people	-14	-2%

Ettrick Primary School, which opened in 1965, belongs to the Council and is a single storey building set on a site extending to 4,117 square metres. The building itself has a gross internal floor area of 204 square metres. It has a tiled pitched roof and harled walls and an electric heating system. The accommodation comprises two general purpose classrooms, an office and kitchen. Parking is provided at the village hall which is situated opposite the school. Site plans of the school are attached as Appendix 2. A photo of the Ettrick Primary School building is shown below:



The staff complement in Ettrick Primary School prior to it being mothballed was a Headteacher shared with Yarrow and Kirkhope Primary Schools, 1.1 full time class teachers, one full time cook/cleaner and 42 hours of support staff time comprising administration, playground supervision and classroom assistant support. A peripatetic janitor visited for a half day each week and a visiting support for learning teacher supported the school termly.

The Ettrick Primary School catchment falls within the catchment of Selkirk High School for secondary education.

A condition survey was carried out on the building in June 2012 and the overall site is rated as Condition B (performing well but showing minor deterioration). Condition is an assessment of physical condition of the school and its grounds.

The suitability of Ettrick Primary School was assessed in 2012 prior to mothballing and was categorised as B (performing well but with minor problems). Suitability as an assessment of the school as a whole, its buildings, its grounds and the impacts these have on the learning and teaching, leisure and social activities and health and wellbeing of all users.

The most recent inspection report carried out by HM Inspectorate of Education (HMIe) is dated 13 December 2011 as this is no longer available on the Education Scotland website a copy of the letter to parents informing them of the outcomes is accordingly attached as Appendix 3.

6 KIRKHOPE PRIMARY SCHOOL

Kirkhope Primary serves the village of Ettrickbridge and the local area. The catchment of the school is 9804 Hectares, (98 km2) and is detailed on the map below.



The Scottish Government's Rural School List 2015 classifies Kirkhope Primary School as "Accessiblerural" school under Section 14 of the 2010 Act. The classification is based on two main criteria, settlement size and accessibility based on drive time. For Kirkhope Primary School the classification criteria is "settlements of fewer than 3,000 people and within 30 minutes' drive of a settlement of 10,000 or more". (Source: Scottish Government Rural School List 2015.)

Kirkhope Primary School and Ettrick Primary School are both located in the 2011 based datazone S01012378, named Ettrick Water and Bowhill Area. This datazone is classified as a 5 (Accessible Rural) within the Scottish Governments 6 fold urban-rural classification. It has a SIMD2016 decile of 6.

The first table below, derived from National Records of Scotland data, shows the age group distribution for the datazone in which both Primary Schools are situated, and how it has changed between 2001 and 2015. In 2001 there were 154 children (aged 0 to 15) living in this area, which was 23% of the population. However by 2015 there were 61 children (aged 0 to 15) living in this area, which is 11% of the population.

Ettrick Water and	d Bowhill Area (S01012378)		
Year	Age Group	Population	Percent
	0 to 15	154	23%
2001 (best fit	16 to 64	431	64%
2001 COA to	65+	84	13%
DZ2011)	All people	669	100%
	0 to 15	76	13%
	16 to 64	371	66%
2011 Pop by	65+	119	21%
DZ2011	All people	566	100%
	0 to 15	61	11%
	16 to 64	347	63%
2015 Pop by	65+	144	26%
DZ2011	All people	552	100%

As can be seen from the second table below, also derived from National Records of Scotland data, in the period between 2011 and 2015 the number of children (aged 0 to 15) living in this area dropped by 15, representing a 20% decrease in the number of children in the area.

Ettr	rick Water and Bowhill Area (SO		
	Change 2011 to 2015	Count	Percent
	0 to 15	-15	-20%
	16 to 64	-24	-6%
	65+	25	21%
	All people	-14	-2%

Kirkhope Primary School, which dates from 1873, belongs to Scottish Borders Council and is a single storey stone building with a slate roof set on a site extending to 955m². The building has a 1960s extension with harled walls and roof. Accommodation comprises two general purpose classrooms, an office area, a staff room, a general purpose room and a small kitchen. Toilet facilities for the disabled and a purpose-built nursery were added in 2000. The gross internal floor area is 285m². The building has a combination of solar and electric heating. For Physical Education or other activities, pupils walk the short distance to the sports field or village hall. Parking is provided at the

School. Site plans of the school are attached as Appendix 4. A photo of the Kirkhope Primary School building is shown below:



Kirkhope Primary School has a Headteacher, shared with Yarrow Primary, two full time equivalent class teachers and support from the Principal teacher who is based at Yarrow but works with both schools. Teacher non-contact cover is provided by visiting specialist teachers for art, music or PE and a support for learning teacher visits the school regularly. Support staff includes a Primary School Administrator and playground supervisor, a cook and cleaner. A Peripatetic janitor also visits once a week.

The Kirkhope Primary School catchment falls within the catchment of Selkirk High School for secondary education.

A condition survey was carried out on the building in June 2012 and the overall site is rated as Condition B - Satisfactory (Building serviceable but in need of some repair, works recommended in 3-5 years.). Condition is an assessment of physical condition of the school and its grounds.

A suitability survey was carried out in 2012 on Kirkhope Primary School and it was rated B - Satisfactory (performing well but with minor problems). Suitability as an assessment of the school as a whole, its buildings, its grounds and the impacts these have on the learning and teaching, leisure and social activities and health and wellbeing of all users. These surveys are undertaken on a 4 year cycle and data is reviewed and investment planned accordingly annually.

The roll of Kirkhope Primary School in 2016/17 is 17 pupils, only one of those pupils lives in the Ettrick catchment area.

The most recent inspection report carried out by HM Inspectorate of Education (HMIe) is dated 21 August 2012 and can be accessed by the following link:

http://www.educationscotland.gov.uk/Images/KirkhopePSNCINS21082012_tcm4-727098.pdf

7 YARROW PRIMARY SCHOOL

Yarrow Primary School is situated at the eastern end of the hamlet of Yarrow Feus and serves the widely scattered rural community of the Yarrow Valley. The catchment of the school is 204km² (78.8 square miles) and is highlighted on the map below.



The Scottish Government's Rural School List 2015 classifies Yarrow Primary School as "remote-rural" school under Section 14 of the 2010 Act. The classification is based on two main criteria, settlement size and accessibility based on drive time. For Yarrow Primary School the classification criteria is "settlements of fewer than 3,000 people and with a drive time of between 30 and 60 minutes to a settlement of 10,000 or more". (Source: Scottish Government Rural School List 2015.)

Yarrow Primary School is located in the 2011 based datazone S01012379, named Yarrow Water and Sunderland Area. This datazone is classified as a 6 (Remote Rural) within the Scottish Governments 6 fold urban-rural classification. It has a SIMD2016 decile of 6. The table below shows that age group distribution for the datazone in which Yarrow Primary School is situated.

The first table below, derived from National Records of Scotland data, shows the age group distribution for the datazone in which Yarrow Primary School is situated, and how it has changed between 2001 and 2015. In 2001 there were 118 children (aged 0 to 15) living in this area, which was 18.6% of the population. However by 2015 there were 103 children (aged 0 to 15) living in this area, which due to a decrease in the overall population amounts to 20% of the population.

Yarrow Water and	Yarrow Water and Sunderland Area (S01012379)		
Year	Age Group	Population	Percent
	0 to 15	118	18.6%
2001 (best fit	16 to 64	430	67.7%
2001 COA to	65+	87	13.7%
DZ2011)	All people	635	100%
	0 to 15	90	17.3%
	16 to 64	323	62.1%
2011 Pop by	65+	107	20.6%
DZ2011	All people	520	100%
	0 to 15	103	20%
	16 to 64	279	54.3%
2015 Pop by	65+	132	25.7%
DZ2011	All people	514	100%

As can be seen from the second table below, also derived from National Records of Scotland data, in the period between 2011 and 2015 the number of children (aged 0 to 15) living in this area increased by 13, representing a 14% increase in the number of children in the area.

Yarrow Water and Sunderland Area (S01012379)			
	Change 2011 to 2015	Count	Percent
	0 to 15	13	14%
	16 to 64	-44	-14%
	65+	25	23%
Count	All people	-6	-1%

Yarrow Primary School, which was built in 1960, belongs to Scottish Borders Council and is a single storey brick building with slated pitch roof. The school is set on a site extending to 1930m². The accommodation comprises two general purpose classrooms, an office area, a small kitchen and toilet facilities. The gross internal floor area is 223m². Pupils walk the short distance to the Village Hall for Physical Education. Parking is provided at the school. Site plans of the school are attached as Appendix 5. A photo of the Ettrick Primary School building is shown below:



Yarrow Primary School has a Headteacher, shared with Kirkhope Primary, a Principal teacher who teaches the class four days per week and a part time teacher. The Principal Teacher also supports Kirkhope Primary. Teacher non-contact cover is provided by visiting specialist teachers for art, music or PE and a support for learning teacher visits the school regularly. Support staff includes a Primary School Administrator and playground supervisor, a cook and cleaner. A Peripatetic janitor also visits once a week.

The Yarrow Primary School catchment falls within the catchment of Selkirk High School for secondary education.

A condition survey was carried out on the building in June 2012 and the overall site is rated as Condition B - Satisfactory (Building Serviceable but in need of some repair, works recommended in 3-5 years.). Condition is an assessment of physical condition of the school and its grounds.

A suitability survey was carried out in 2012 on Yarrow Primary School and it was rated B - Satisfactory (performing well but with minor problems). Suitability as an assessment of the school as a whole, its buildings, its grounds and the impacts these have on the learning and teaching, leisure and social activities and health and wellbeing of all users. These surveys are undertaken on a 4 year cycle and data is reviewed and investment planned accordingly annually.

The roll of Yarrow Primary School in 2016/17 is 14 pupils; none of these pupils lives in the Ettrick catchment area.

The most recent inspection report carried out by HM Inspectorate of Education (HMIe) is dated 13 December 2011 and can be accessed by the following link.

http://www.educationscotland.gov.uk/inspectionandreview/reports/school/primsec/YarrowPrimary SchoolScottishBorders.asp

8 COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT

8.1 Meetings

Prior to the mothballing of the School, informal consultations took place with the Local Community. Since mothballing Informal discussions have been held between the Service Director Children and Young People, Scottish Borders Council and key members of the Ettrick Community regarding the interim and long term use of the Ettrick Primary School building.

8.2 Feedback from Meetings

The Community in general viewed the mothballing as appropriate but that they did not wish for this to continue indefinitely and are supportive of a final decision being made. The general consensus is that with the current children numbers the Ettrick and Yarrow valleys can only sustain 2 not 3 primary schools and that Ettrick is the most appropriate to close. The community wanted to make long term plans regarding the use of the building.

The Community view the freeing up of the building through closure of the School as a potential opportunity.

9. EDUCATIONAL BENEFITS OPTION ASSESSMENT FACTORS

Scottish Borders Council has statutory duties relating to the provision of Education which we fulfil in our school provision. These duties are set out in legislation and include:

- a) Education (Scotland) Act 1980, Section 1, which requires Scottish Borders Council to secure for their area adequate and efficient provision of school education.
- b) Standards in Scotland's Schools Etc Act 2000, Section 3, which requires Scottish Borders Council to endeavour to raise standards and secure improvement in the quality of school education provided in our schools. The education we provide must be directed to the development of the personality, talents and the mental and physical abilities of the children or young people to their fullest potential.
- c) Education (Additional Support for Learning) Scotland Act 2004 and the Education (Additional Support for Learning)(Scotland)Act 2009, which requires Scottish Borders Council to identify and provide support for any children with additional support needs and prepare co-ordinated support plans for those with the most extensive needs.
- d) Scottish Schools (Parental Involvement) Act 2009 which requires Scottish Borders Council to give advice and information to a parent of a school pupil when reasonably requested, on any matter relating to the education provided to that pupil.
- e) Scottish Schools (Parental Involvement) Act 2009 which requires Scottish Borders Council to give advice and information to a parent of a school pupil when reasonably requested, on any matter relating to the education provided to that pupil.
- f) Children and Young People's Act 2014 requires Scottish Borders Council to implement key policies relating to Early Learning and Childcare, provide additional support for children and young people who are looked after and accommodated including kinship care, extend free school meals and strengthen the rights and participation of children and young people.

Scottish Borders Council sets out within the context of national and local policies what it is aiming to achieve in terms of raising levels of achievement and attainment and improving educational outcomes for all children and young people in the key priorities set out in our Business Plan and our Children and Young People's Services Plan.

Our key priority is "to improve attainment and achievement levels for all our children and young people, both within and outwith the formal curriculum."

As part of a multi-agency partnership, we have identified the following priorities within our Children and Young People's Services Plan:

- a) Raising attainment and achievement for all and closing the gap between the lowest and highest achievers
- b) Promoting the health and well-being of all children and young people and reducing health inequalities
- c) Keeping children and young people safe
- d) Improving the well-being and life chances for our most vulnerable children and young people
- e) Increasing participation and engagement

The purpose of the curriculum is encapsulated in the four capacities to enable each child or young person to be:

- (a) a successful learner;
- (b) a confident individual;
- (c) a responsible citizen; and
- (d) an effective contributor.

The curriculum aims to ensure that all children and young people in Scotland develop the knowledge, skills and attributes they will need if they are to flourish in life, learning and work, now and in the future. The attributes and capabilities of the four capacities are outlined below:

successful learners	confident individuals	responsible citizens	effective contributors
attributes	attributes • self-respect • a sense of physical, mental and emotional well-being • secure values and beliefs • ambition capabilities • relate to others and manage themselves • pursue a healthy and active lifestyle • be self-aware • develop and communicate their own beliefs and view of the world • live as independently as they can • assess risk and make informed decisions • achieve success in different areas of activity.	attributes • respect for others • commitment to participate responsibly in political, economic, social and cultural life capabilities • develop knowledge and understanding of the world and Scotland's place in it • understand different beliefs and cultures • make informed choices and decisions • evaluate environmental, scientific and technological issues • develop informed, ethical views of complex issues.	attributes • an enterprising attitude • resilience • self-reliance capabilities • communicate in different ways and in different settings • work in partnership and in teams • take the initiative and lead • apply critical thinking in new contexts • create and develop • solve problems

For each of the eight curriculum areas the Education Scotland has in place a set of statements entitled "Experiences and Outcomes" which describe the expectations for learning and progression for that areas, these can be found here:

https://education.gov.scot/scottish-education-system/policy-for-scottish-education/policydrivers/cfe-(building-from-the-statement-appendix-incl-btc1-5)/Experiences%20and%20outcomes

The title of these statements recognises the importance of the quality and nature of the learning experience in developing attributes and capabilities and in achieving active engagement, motivation and depth of learning. An outcome represents what is to be achieved.

The experiences and outcomes for each curriculum area build in all the attributes and capabilities and so develop the four capacities. All our schools in the Scottish Borders are expected to deliver Curriculum for Excellence as set out within the four capacities and the experiences and outcomes.

Our school estate must be fit for purpose and support the delivery of Curriculum for Excellence whilst maximising educational opportunities and benefits for all our children and young people.

Scottish Borders Council's Children's Services has a further duty to deliver a service which meets the criteria for best value, in terms of efficiency, effectiveness, economy and equal opportunities, and which meets the agreed priorities in the Single Outcome Agreement and Scottish Borders Council's Corporate Plan.

The Educational Benefits of the various options have been assessed taking account of all the above stated factors and having regard to the Guidance and Explanatory Notes published by the Scottish

Government in association with the 2010 Act and which are available for reference at the following websites, respectively:

www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/91982/0097130.doc

www.oqps.gov.uk/legislation/acts2010/en/aspen_20100002_en.pdf

"An education authority shall endeavour to secure improvement in the quality of school education which is provided in the schools managed by them; and they shall exercise their functions in relation to such provision with a view to raising Standards of education."

In accordance with the 2010 Act, Educational Benefits are set out for the potential closure and each reasonable alternative, both in terms of the positives and negatives, on the basis of that option being implemented.

10 POSSIBLE OPTIONS IDENTIFIED

A number of possible options were identified by the Council for the future of Ettrick Primary School namely:

Option 1

Close Ettrick Primary School zoning any pupils to Kirkhope Primary School re-delineate the catchment area,

Option 2

Continue mothballing Ettrick Primary School with the pupils zoned to Kirkhope Primary School;

Option 3

Reopen Ettrick Primary School with its existing catchment area

Option 4

Reopen Ettrick Primary School and re-delineate the catchment area with either Kirkhope and/or Yarrow Primary School catchment areas.

Option 5

Reopen Ettrick Primary School and re-delineate the catchment area adjacent Dumfries and Galloway Primary School catchment areas

Option 6

Close Ettrick Primary School and transfer the pupils to Yarrow Primary School and redelineate the catchment area

Option 7

Close Kirkhope Primary School and transfer the pupils to Ettrick Primary School and redelineate the catchment area

Option 8

Close Yarrow Primary School and transfer the pupils to Ettrick Primary School and redelineate the catchment area In accordance with the 2010 Act the Council is required to assess both the closure proposal and any reasonable alternative to closure. In order to do this the Council has first considered whether any of the above stated theoretically possible options are not reasonable alternatives to closure and therefore do not require detailed assessment. The options stated below were considered not reasonable alternatives for the following reasons:

Option 5

Reopen Ettrick Primary School and re-delineate the catchment area adjacent Dumfries and Galloway Primary School catchment areas

The nearest Primary School to Ettrick Primary School within the Dumfries and Galloway Council area was Eskdalemuir Primary School 13 Miles to the south. However Eskdalemuir Primary School closed in 2005 due to the roll falling to 2 pupils and the pupils were relocated to Hutton Primary School, which lies 20 miles to the south west of Ettrick Primary School. Even if pupil numbers in the former Eskdalemuir Primary School to include part or all of it would be unworkable given Eskdalemuir Primary School is in a different local authority area. This option is accordingly not considered by the Council to be a reasonable alternative to closure.

Option 6

Close Ettrick Primary School and transfer the pupils to Yarrow Primary School and redelineate the catchment area

This is plainly still a closure proposal, rather than an alternative to closure. The shortest route between Ettrick Primary School and Yarrow Primary School is 12.5 miles using the B709. While in good weather this route entails a travel time of 27 minutes by car, the single track route over the hills between the valleys is not passable in poorer weather conditions. In poor weather a longer route of 15.5 miles using the B709 and A708, which takes around 40 minutes in good weather, is necessary. Given the travel times involved for a potentially significant portion of the year this was not considered a reasonable alternative closure proposal.

Option 7

Close Kirkhope Primary School and transfer the pupils to Ettrick Primary School and redelineate the catchment area

While this is an alternative proposal to closure for Ettrick Primary School it plainly still results in a closure proposal. As outlined above Kirkhope Primary School is rated good in terms of suitability and condition for its purpose and has a relatively bigger school roll of 17, with a maximum capacity of 50. Closure of Kirkhope Primary School instead of Ettrick Primary school would result in substantially more pupils and staff requiring to relocate and generally travel further to reach the school. In terms of safe travel Ettrick Primary School is more vulnerable to adverse weather than Kirkhope Primary School and the likelihood of closure due to adverse weather would be increased with more pupils having to travel a greater distance to this school. This was not considered a reasonable alternative closure proposal.

Option 8

Close Yarrow Primary School and transfer the pupils to Ettrick Primary School and redelineate the catchment area

While this is an alternative proposal to closure for Ettrick Primary School it plainly still results in a closure proposal. As outlined above Yarrow Primary School is good in terms of suitability and condition for its purpose and had a relatively bigger school roll of 14, with a maximum capacity of 50. Closure of Yarrow Primary School instead of Ettrick Primary school would result

in substantially more pupils and staff requiring to relocate and generally travel further to reach the school. As outlined in more detail above these two schools are in different valleys and travel times between them are substantial. The likelihood of closure of Ettrick Primary School due to adverse weather would be increased with more pupils having to travel a greater distance by challenging routes to this school. This was not considered a reasonable alternative closure proposal.

11 CLOSURE PROPOSAL AND REASONABLE ALTERNATIVE PROPOSALS ASSESSED

The potential closure proposal and reasonable alternative proposals for the future of Ettrick Primary School that are assessed in detail below are as follows:

Option 1

Close Ettrick Primary School zoning any pupils to Kirkhope Primary School re-delineate the catchment area,

Option 2

Continue mothballing Ettrick Primary School with the pupils zoned to Kirkhope Primary School;

Option 3

Reopen Ettrick Primary School with its existing catchment area

Option 4

Reopen Ettrick Primary School and re-delineate the catchment area with either Kirkhope and/or Yarrow Primary School catchment areas.

11.1

Option 1

Close Ettrick Primary School Zoning any Pupils to Kirkhope Primary School, Re-delineate the Catchment Area

Kirkhope Primary	2016/	2017/	2018/	2019/	2020/
	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021
Approved Capacity	50	50	50	50	50
Kirkhope Roll Projection	17	12	11	10	8
Ettrick Roll Projection	6	7	7	4	2
Total Roll Projection	23	19	18	14	10

As the above table shows Kirkhope Primary School currently accommodates pupils from Ettrick Primary School catchment area as a result of the mothballing in 2012. The pupil numbers in the Ettrick Primary School catchment area are not projected to significantly increase and Kirkhope Primary School has capacity to accommodate these pupils. It should be noted that the projected pupil numbers at Kirkhope are likely to remain the same or reduce slightly for at least the next four years. The current occupancy rate for Kirkhope Primary School including current pupils from Ettrick Primary School catchment area is 34% (Census September 2015).

Educational Benefits - Impact on Pupils

There are educational benefits associated with the proposals which will positively impact upon the pupils in the Ettrick and Kirkhope catchment:

- Pupils attending a school where a larger peer group will be able to experience a variety of learning and teaching experiences offered through flexibility of grouping.
- It is self-evident that a small school roll severely restricts opportunities for team sports and other active recreational activities. This applies even to individual sports, where successful learning of skills is helped by talking and sharing experiences. It further applies to the health and wellbeing element of the curriculum which involves discussion between pupils about health lifestyle choices. Whilst these problems can be overcome by taking the pupils to participate in activities in a neighbouring school, that in itself involves time out of school travelling there and back.
- Some of the educational benefits arise not just from larger pupil numbers but also because a larger staff and parent body increases the likelihood of interested adults leading a range of activities will support the provision of a richer and higher quality curriculum.
- As with sports, the larger roll would also provide a greater likelihood of pupils benefitting from a wider range of solo and group musical and artistic opportunities.
- As part of the Developing Scotland's Young Workforce the aim is to develop increased awareness of the world of work, social skills and employability skills. Such knowledge and understanding and skills acquisition very much benefit from discussions and dialogue with peers of the same age/stage.
- The level to which pupils are able to become skilled in social interaction will depend to an extent on the opportunities afforded to them. The forging of close friendships and the development of self-esteem is enhanced by each pupil being enabled to be part of an age appropriate peer group of a sufficient size to allow a range of interactions and relationships to form and reform.
- The development of an Early Learning and Childcare structure across a larger catchment area involving more pupils provides a viable service. This was provided in the town of Selkirk during recent years. Children at a younger age will benefit from having a provision in the valley as there is an Early Learning and Childcare provision currently at Kirkhope. With children attending who have similar interests and life experiences; the richness of the rural valley life will come through in an early level curriculum driven by child centred learning experiences.

Educational Benefits - Impact on staff

- The staff will be part of a larger team and will be able to share planning and curricular resources. They can also learn from each other to provide improved approaches to learning and teaching. As a one teacher school, Ettrick Primary School, could present challenges in attracting and supporting staff.
- The staff will not be isolated as in a single teacher school such as Ettrick. In Kirkhope they will be able to receive support in providing an inclusive curriculum and work together to provide support to children who may have additional support needs.

Educational Benefits-Impact upon the community

- Kirkhope Primary School is in the heart of a vibrant village and provides a gathering place for families and communities. They have recently benefitted from the gift of a woodland environment and learning cabin (within a 100m of the school) to support environmental education and promote sustainability. This is a strong feature of the curriculum and the sustainability element very important to the community.
- Kirkhope Primary School is within the heart of the community and is viewed as a natural gathering place for families within the Selkirk valleys. More children being located within Kirkhope Primary School will bring a greater sense of community to the west side of the valley and bring support to parents and remove feelings of isolation and vulnerability.

Rural Factors – Impact from Travel Arrangements

Pupils living in the Ettrick catchment area prior to mothballing had a maximum travel time of around 28 minutes. The travel distance from Ettrick Primary School to Kirkhope Primary School is 11.4 miles. The time taken to travel between the two Schools is approximately 27 minutes (google maps).

The one pupil from the Ettrick catchment area currently travels a distance of 7.7 miles to Kirkhope Primary School (location centre) compared to a 3.8 mile journey to Ettrick Primary School. The travel time for the affected pupil is currently approximately 20 minutes which is not unreasonable. This travel arrangement has been in place for almost five years. This travel distance it not an unreasonable distance to expect children to travel for primary school education in rural areas. Other catchment areas in Scottish Borders also comprise such a travel distance.

The Council currently provides travel for the pupil in the Ettrick catchment to attend Kirkhope Primary School. This journey mirrors the route for the transport to Selkirk High School so the journey will therefore be consistent when the pupil transitions to secondary education. The impact for that child is that it results in a slightly longer home to school journey. However in terms of the impacts of future children from the Ettrick catchment area the proposal will result in longer journeys for some and for others it will shorten their journey. The distance to Kirkhope Primary School is less for staff and the provision of services from key Council departments is more accessible at Kirkhope Primary School than it was to provide services at Ettrick. Changing the catchment of Ettrick Primary School to Kirkhope Primary School during the mothballing has generally had a positive impact upon travelling time for children.

However it is recognised that adverse weather in the winter currently impacts on travel arrangements in this area. In terms of adverse weather, Ettrick Primary School would generally be more affected than Kirkhope. However there are always likely to be issues in the area because of the location. All schools in the Scottish Borders have an emergency closure plan for severe weather. Resilient Schools is a programme set up by Scottish Borders Council to keep as many schools as possible open in bad weather. In the event that Resilient Schools is invoked, all transport is cancelled and staff travel to their pre-arranged nearest school. If there is a sufficient level of staff available, a school will open and pupils who normally walk to school will attend. The status of these Schools comprised in this report would be that Ettrick would be closed and Kirkhope would be open.

From the community meetings concerns were not raised in terms of travel arrangements posing a problem or the additional distance being an issue.

Rural Factors - Community Impact

The Scottish Borders Council has considered the impact upon the community. The majority of comments at consultation are in relation to the experiences since mothballing were positive and broadly unified the community. In addition many people supported the school closure and had suggestions for the building's use after closure. However a number of people did comment that they were sad to see the school go. There was a general feeling that continued mothballing was not an option and that a more final solution was required.

The community has made positive use of Ettrick Primary School since it was mothballed in 2012. The James Hogg exhibition, which was previously housed in Aikwood Tower, was moved into the school. The exhibition not only celebrates the life and works of James Hogg, the famous Ettrick shepherd, poet and writer but it also provides a base which visitors can attend to explore the attractions of the Ettrick Valley : walking routes, birdwatching, fishing. The building can provide visitors with toilet access and an opportunity to purchase tourist leaflets etc. A group of community volunteers have maintained the building and grounds. Visitors to the exhibition are regular and appreciative. Many families who no longer live in Scotland but have heritage links to the Ettrick community have visited from overseas. The museum also attracts many visitors with an interest in James' Hogg writing.

The school car park is directly opposite the village hall which has limited parking space and supports parking during events such as ceilidhs and visiting drama activities. The use of the school building has had a positive impact upon both sustaining visitors to the community and in supporting local community activities. The volunteer group is currently exploring new sustainability projects in the valley which could also be based within the school building.

Any sense of loss of social connection through the mothballing of the school has so far been minimised through the additional facilities being provided at the school building. However it is recognised that the school building may be put to other uses and the community will be given further opportunities at consultation to discuss this. In addition, the Community Empowerment (Scotland) Act 2015 sets out a new right for community organisations to request the transfer of local assets to local community ownership/management. Public bodies including Councils must consider such requests and respond within a reasonable timescale.

Financial and Staffing Implications

Staffing

Given the mothballed status of Ettrick Primary School and the very small predicted future rolls in the Ettrick catchment area, there will be no requirement for additional staff in Kirkhope Primary School consequent upon the closure of Ettrick Primary School.

There are no surplus staff from Ettrick Primary School to be dealt with according to the Council's current redeployment and redundancy procedures.

Financial

The financial savings generated from mothballing Ettrick Primary School amount to approximately £87,000 annually. This saving is predominantly made up of staff and building costs. The 2012/13 annual running costs for electricity, cleaning and property maintenance was £9,556. See Appendix 6 for detailed financial information.

The approximate cost of bringing the property into an acceptable condition for reopening would be £10,000 for fire safety, fabric, mechanical and electrical works. It should be noted that there may be potentially further costs for structural works if the building were to reopen permanently and be used into the long term. A provisional structural survey has been undertaken.

These financial savings support the delivery of Education across the whole of the Scottish Borders.

Environmental Impact

The additional travel of children to Kirkhope Primary is cancelled out by the reduction of services and visiting staff travelling to Ettrick Primary School. There has been no increase in the Council's carbon footprint. A permanent arrangement would have to be made about the future of the school building in a permanent closure.

The school building is on a flood plain so there is no likelihood of developing the site for housing. Discussions would be required with the community to explore a community asset transfer opportunity.

Summary/Conclusions

Kirkhope Primary School currently accommodates pupils from Ettrick Primary and the pupil numbers are not projected to increase significantly. Kirkhope Primary has capacity to continue to accommodate the projected pupil numbers. This option is considered to be reasonable.

11.2 Option 2

Continue Mothballing Ettrick Primary School with the Pupils Zoned to Kirkhope Primary School

The school has been mothballed for over four years. The statutory guidance to the 2010 Act in relation to mothballing, states:

"the maximum length of its duration is likely to depend on the location of the school and the desirability of maintaining capacity to reopen a school there, but it is unlikely that it should exceed three years in areas that are not very remote."

Pupil numbers are not projected to increase over the next four years as per section 11.1 above.

The 2015 annual running costs for electricity, cleaning, repairs and maintenance was £9,556, however it is possible that this could rise in the future in relation to maintenance costs.

There was a significant view at the community meetings that mothballing the school over a long period was wasteful. It was also the view at the community meetings that the school was already viewed as closed. The community has been putting the school building to good use and there were a large number of suggestions for how the building could be utilised in the future.

Educational Benefits

The educational benefits are largely the same as stated at Option 1 in terms of closure of Ettrick Primary School.

Travel Arrangements

Travel arrangements are as stated above for closure of Ettrick Primary School.

Community Impacts

The negative impacts of the closure of the school would largely remain, but there would be the added uncertainty of it being mothballed over by the community. The community considers that there were challenges in terms of sustaining two schools never mind three in the valley. Therefore there was little point in continuing mothballing.

Financial Impact

The financial saving generated by mothballing Ettrick Primary School is approximately £87,000 would continue. But there may be longer term maintenance or structural costs that would be incurred longer term. Additionally the Council would not have the option to sell the building and utilise this money for education across the Borders.

Environmental Impact

The environmental impacts are largely the same as stated at Option 1 in terms of closure of Ettrick Primary School.

Summary

The school has been mothballed for four years which is in excess of the statutory guidance timescale of three years. Pupil numbers are not projected to rise in terms of pre-school children living within the catchment and there is no planned housebuilding.

At a pre-consultation meeting held as part of the wider review of the school estate in March 2016, community members from the Ettrick and Yarrow Valleys were disappointed that the school was still mothballed and generally considered it was already in effect closed. They considered that the building could be better utilised and that resources were being wasted by keeping the school mothballed.

The community based at the meetings viewed the long term utilisation of the building by the community or otherwise as an opportunity.

On the basis that pupil numbers are not projected to increase mothballing was not a good use of resources and that the building could be used to benefit the community, continued mothballing is not viewed as a reasonable option.

11.3 Option 3 Reopen Ettrick Primary School with its Existing Catchment Area

Community Feedback

The majority of people attending the meeting in March 2016 were not in favour of reopening Ettrick Primary School, there was not demand for the school in terms of requests, the children who were going to Kirkhope were happy and people did not think there was going to be a school again there. The impression was that the school had already been closed.

Pupil Numbers

Ettrick Primary School (Census 2016)

Ettrick Primary School	2016/	2017/	2018/	2019/	2020/
	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021
Roll Projection Total assuming current pupils	6	7	7	4	2
from Ettrick area who attend Kirkhope Primary					
were returned to Ettrick Primary					
Approved Capacity	50	50	50	50	50

If the school were to reopen in August 2017, the maximum pupil numbers from the catchment would be 7. Pupils currently within the catchment area attend Kirkhope Primary School. It is not certain that any of the pupils from Ettrick Primary School catchment area would return to the school were it to reopen. In addition, pupil numbers over the next four years, based on aggregated data, are projected to decrease.

Educational Benefits

As stated above there is firstly a question over whether the pupils would attend Ettrick Primary School if it was reopened and even when including all pupils within the catchment, the roll remains very small. Opportunities for working with others of a similar age and stage are very limited in schools of less than 10 children in a multi-composite setting. The educational benefits that have been detailed in section 11.1 in respect of combining the Ettrick and Kirkhope pupils at Kirkhope clearly cannot be achieved with the pupils returning to Ettrick. In particular:

- Pupils attending a school with a small peer group will not be able to experience a variety
 of learning and teaching experience offered through flexibility of groupings. Such a small
 school roll severely restricts opportunities for team sports and other active recreational
 activities. As more detailed in previous sections, this applies also to individual sports.
 Whilst some of these problems can be overcome by taking pupils to participate in
 activities in a neighbouring school, that in itself involves time out of school travelling
 there and back.
- Having small pupil numbers results in a small number of staff and a smaller parent body reducing the likelihood of interested adults leading a range of activities to support the provision of a richer and higher quality curriculum. This supports a small would reduce the likelihood of pupils benefitting from a wide range of solo and group musical and artistic opportunities when compared with a school with a larger roll.
- As part of the Developing Scotland's Young Workforce the aim is to develop increased awareness of the world of work, social skills and employability skills. Such knowledge

and understanding of skills acquisition very much benefit from discussions and dialogue with peers of the same age and stage. This would be very difficult to achieve with such a small school roll.

• In addition there is no Early Learning and Childcare provision in the catchment area of Ettrick.

Educational Benefits and Impacts on Staff

As has been outlined regarding the position pre-closure, that staff would be isolated as in a single teacher school and would not be able to receive the same support in providing an inclusive curriculum and being able to work together with other teachers to provide support to children who may have additional support needs as would be possible within a larger school setting. Staff benefit from being part of a larger team and being able to share planning and curricular resources and also learning from each other.

Ettrick as a one-teacher school would present challenges in attracting and supporting staff.

Rural Factors – Travel Arrangements

Pupils in the Ettrick catchment area prior to mothballing had a maximum travel time of around 28 minutes. The travel distance from Ettrick Primary School to Kirkhope Primary School is 11.4 miles. The time taken to travel between the two schools is approximately 27 minutes (google maps). The pupil in the Ettrick catchment area currently travel distances of 7 to Kirkhope Primary School (location centre). The maximum travel time for any affected pupil is currently approximately 30 minutes which is not unreasonable. These travel arrangements have been in place for almost five years.

Plainly if this proposal was to go ahead and parents and children took up the option to return to Ettrick Primary School the current position would be altered. However as alluded to in above options, reopening would in fact result for some children a longer journey than currently, while for other children a shorter journey, as compared with the status quo of pupils in the Ettrick Primary School catchment attending Kirkhope Primary School.

It would result in an increase in distance for staff travelling to Ettrick Primary School to provide the services and Ettrick is less accessible to key Council departments in terms of providing services.

Adverse Weather

As stated earlier it is recognised that adverse weather in the winter currently impacts on travel arrangements in this area. In terms of adverse weather, a reopened Ettrick Primary School would generally be more vulnerable to closure than Kirkhope. However there are always likely to be issues in the area because of the location. Resilient Schools is a programme set up by Scottish Borders Council to keep as many schools as possible open in bad weather. In the event that Resilient Schools is invoked, all transport is cancelled and staff travel to their pre-arranged nearest school. If there is a sufficient level of staff available, a school will open and pupils who normally walk to school will attend. The status of these Schools comprised in this Report would be that Ettrick would be closed, Yarrow would be closed and Kirkhope would be open.

Rural Factors – Community Impact

The school was not used for external lets prior to being mothballed. While the school has been mothballed the community has utilised the building by holding the James Hogg exhibition. The school car park has also been able to be utilised for village hall functions. The building could not be utilised for this purpose if the school was reopened.

The community did consider that the school building should be used for another purpose but that exact purpose is as yet unclear. Given the adjacent village hall it is not the case that the school represents the sole hall for the community.

Financial Impact

The approximate cost of bringing the property into an acceptable condition for reopening is £10,000 for fire safety, fabric, mechanical and electrical works. It should be noted that there may be potentially further costs for structural works if the building were to reopen permanently and be used into the long term. A provisional structural survey has been undertaken.

The financial savings generated from mothballing Ettrick Primary School amount to approximately £87,000. This is predominantly made up of staff and building costs. These savings would be lost if the school was reopened. Additionally the Council would not have the option to sell the building and utilise this money for education across the Borders.

Environmental Impact

The reduced travel for some of the children to Ettrick Primary would be cancelled out by the impact of reinstating services and staff having to travel further to access Ettrick Primary School.

Summary

Pupil numbers for the Ettrick Primary School catchment area are low, 1 pupil as at September 2015 census, and only projected to rise to a maximum of 7 in 2017/18. It is not certain whether any of the pupils from the catchment area would return to the school should it reopen, so it is possible that if it reopened in August 2017 that there would be no pupils.

There are significant educational dis-benefits in reopening Ettrick Primary School with such a small school roll versus the combined provision that is currently provided at Kirkhope.

Travel arrangements for pupils have been in place for nearly five years and the impacts are fairly neutral in terms of some pupils having to travel further and some less than before.

Based on the fact that there would:-

- potentially be no pupils in August 2017;
- that there are considered to be educational dis-benefits;
- that the community are keen to find an alternative use for the building;

Option 3 is not considered a reasonable option.

11.4 Option 4

Reopen Ettrick Primary School and re-delineate the catchment area with either Kirkhope and/or Yarrow Primary School catchment areas.

The mapping analysis of pupil addresses has been carried out to identify whether the catchment area for Ettrick could be made more sustainable by extending it into one or more of the neighbouring catchment areas of Kirkhope and Yarrow Primary Schools. These catchment areas are largely sparsely populated because of the terrain and options in relation to travel are also limited. The summary of the findings is as follows:

Kirkhope Primary School only has 17 pupils which equates to 34% capacity within the school. Many of the pupils attending the school live in the village of Ettrickbridge or close to the village. Moving the catchment area significantly would result in pupils from the village of Ettrickbridge being transported to Ettrick to attend school.

Yarrow Primary School only has 14 pupils which equates to 28% capacity within the school. Many of the pupils attending the school live in the village of Yarrow or close to the village. Moving the catchment area significantly would result in pupils from the village of Yarrow being transported to Ettrick to attend school.

Community feedback on this option was that it was impractical and that the two schools are currently operating under capacity and it will be challenging to sustain with pupil numbers. It is considered that there is no need for a third school and that they want to see both Kirkhope and Yarrow properly supported in their current form.

Educational Benefits

As highlighted in Option 3 above (11.3) there are significant educational benefits to pupils and staff in attending a larger school. The reopening of Ettrick Primary School coupled with a delineating of the 3 Schools catchment areas would therefore have a negative impact on all 3 schools as pupil numbers would be spread more thinly with no discernible educational benefit arising.

Travel Arrangements

The precise travel impacts would depend on exactly how the catchments were redelineated. However as set out in the above given the remote location of Ettrick Primary School relative to Kirkhope and Yarrow Primary schools any re-delineation of the catchment areas would result in significantly increased and potentially impractical travel for more pupils.

Financial Impact

The approximate cost of bringing the property into an acceptable condition for reopening is £10,000 for fire safety, fabric, mechanical and electrical works. It should be noted that there may be potentially further costs for structural works if the building were to reopen permanently and be used into the long term. A provisional structural survey has been undertaken.

The financial savings generated from mothballing Ettrick Primary School amount to approximately £87,000. This is predominantly made up of staff and building costs. These savings would be lost if the school was reopened. Additionally the Council could not proceed to sell the building and utilise corporate receipt.

Environmental Impact

The reduced travel for some of the children to Ettrick Primary would be cancelled out by the impact of reinstating services and staff having to travel further to access Ettrick Primary School.

Summary

Following a mapping exercise, it is unlikely that the catchment area could be made more sustainable with the options examined; this is because most pupils in the neighbouring catchment areas live either in the Ettrickbridge or Yarrow or in the immediate vicinity. Reducing the catchment of each school could impact on the viability of all 3 schools by reducing respective pupil numbers within their catchment areas. This option may also have a negative impact on the Communities within Kirkhope and Yarrow by the sustainability of the schools within their area.

It is therefore not a reasonable option.

11.5 Overview of Options

Outcome of options appraisal summarised below:

Option	Option Description	Outcome
1	Close Ettrick Primary School zoning any pupils to Kirkhope Primary School, redelineate the catchment area	Accepted as the most appropriate option
2	Continue mothballing Ettrick Primary School with the pupils zoned to Kirkhope Primary School	Rejected as not the most appropriate option
3	Reopen Ettrick Primary School with its existing catchment area	Rejected as not the most appropriate option
4	Reopen Ettrick Primary School and re-delineate the catchment area with either Kirkhope and/or Yarrow Primary School catchment areas.	Rejected as not the most appropriate option

The outcome of the Options Appraisal recommends Option 1 - Close Ettrick Primary Schoolzoning any pupils to Kirkhope Primary School, re-delineate the catchment area of Ettrick Primary to Kirkhope Primary as the most appropriate option.

12 CONCLUSIONS

Given Ettrick Primary School is a rural school, Scottish Borders Council, in accordance with the 2010 Act, as amended by the 2014 Act, considered each potentially viable option and if it had the potential to be a reasonable alternative to closure it was considered in detail, including specific rural factors of travel arrangements, community impact and also the educational benefits.

After identifying that there were three reasonable alternatives to closure this Report has reviewed these alternative options together with the Closure proposal in respect of considering the future of Ettrick Primary School. Information was collated on pupil numbers, housebuilding, finances, the schools, travel arrangements, environmental impact on the local area and community to inform the options.

On review of the Options, Option 1 to close Ettrick Primary School and zone any pupils to Kirkhope Primary School and re-delineate the catchment of Ettrick Primary School to Kirkhope Primary School was considered both reasonable and the most appropriate response.

Future pupil projections have been considered using aggregated data on both Kirkhope Primary School and Ettrick Primary School pupil numbers are projected to fall.

Travel distance to the neighbouring school is not excessive, with 27 minutes travel time between the two schools. The pupil formerly at Ettrick Primary School already attending Kirkhope Primary School already makes this journey.

Environmental impacts are negligible considering the small number of pupils that are travelling and also the fact that in several of those cases they are actually travelling a shorter distance than they were before.

The financial savings generated from mothballing Ettrick Primary School amount to approximately $\pm 87,000$ annually. These savings shall support the delivery of education across the whole of the Scottish Borders area.

Pupils from the Ettrick Primary School area have been zoned to Kirkhope Primary School for over four years. Kirkhope Primary School offers a learning environment that encourages high levels of achievement and provides a wide range of opportunities for children to achieve their full potential, successful learners, confident individuals, responsible citizens and effective contributors.

Ettrick Primary School prior to closure was not used extensively for local community events, other than those associated with the school. Ettrick already has a village hall across the road.

The school has been mothballed for over four years and there is some feeling in the community that the school had already been closed. The community consider that a final decision should be made to allow the building to be used for a better purpose. The community has in the interim been putting the building to use.

At the community events, people were clear about the challenges which faced their community, less employment, fewer families and fewer pupils. The general view being expressed that with the reduced number of pupils, two primary schools was the appropriate number for the Valley and that going forwards it remained challenging for there to be sufficient pupils for these two schools.

The community is positive towards the possibilities and opportunities which could be created if the building were developed or sold, particularly if the community were able to acquire it.

In summary, it is proposed that the statutory consultation takes place on a proposal to close Ettrick Primary School and zone any pupils to Kirkhope Primary School and redelineate the catchment area of Ettrick Primary School to Kirkhope Primary School. Ettrick Primary School has been mothballed since 2012 and arrangements have been in place for pupils to attend Kirkhope Primary School since that time.

APPENDIX 1

PUPIL NUMBERS AND PROJECTIONS

Calculating Projected Rolls

Every year the primary and secondary roll figures from the annual census are used as the starting point for calculating role projections.

Birth numbers provided by the NHS and data regarding housing planned for the area over a 5 years period are then used alongside school rolls to calculate the number of existing and expected children within the catchment area.

In the calculations an assumption is made that for every 100 houses built, there will be 30 primary and 15 secondary pupils added to the catchment school area. These figures are realistic in terms of nation levels and local trends.

Patterns within the Borders show that at most half of planned houses are actually achieved and therefore we use the figure of 50% of the planned housing in our calculations.

These calculations provide a forecast of the school rolls expected should all pupils attend the relevant catchment school. This allows us to plan capital investment where required to meet occupancy needs.

School Capacities

School capacities were last updated in 2006. They are currently only, updated annually if a school has had any alterations that would affect its capacity.

In October 2014, the Scottish produced new guidelines on how to define and calculate school capacities for Primary Schools (link below). In the next few months Scottish Borders Council will conduct a piece of work to update School capacities based on these guidelines.

Once concluded the new capacities will be updated to reflect any changes. Government (Determining Primary School Capacity <u>http://www.gov.scot/Resource/0046/00461513.pdf</u>)

APPENDIX 2 - ETTRICK PRIMARY SCHOOL LOCATION AND SITE PLANS



ETTRICK PRIMARY SCHOOL LOCATION PLAN

APPENDIX 2 - ETTRICK PRIMARY SCHOOL LOCATION AND SITE PLANS

ETTRICK PRIMARY SCHOOL SITE PLAN



Education Scotland Foghlam Alba

Education Scotland, T1 Saughton House, Broomhouse Drive, Edinburgh EH11 3XD

f 0131 244 8424 e edinburgh@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk

w www.educationscotland.gov.uk

Textphone 01506 600236*

t 0131 244 8293

13 December 2011

Dear Parent/Carer

Ettrick Primary School Scottish Borders Council

Recently, as you may know, my colleagues and I visited and inspected your child's school. Throughout our visit, we talked to all parents and children and we worked closely with the headteacher and staff. We wanted to find out how well children were learning and achieving and how well the school supported children to do their best. The headteacher shared with us the school's successes and priorities for improvement. We looked at some particular aspects of the school's recent work, including how well the school involved children in planning their learning, work with partners to support children's learning and how well staff measured children's progress. As a result, we were able to find out how good the school was at improving children's education. I would now like to tell you what we found.

How well do children learn and achieve?

We found that your children are highly motivated and very keen to learn. There is a calm, purposeful atmosphere within the classroom which helps children to focus on their learning. Children work very well together. At all times they engage very well with their tasks. They are very interested in what they are learning. Children talk confidently about what they have learned. They can describe what they are good at and know what they have to do to improve their work. They are growing in confidence in talking about how they learn in differing ways. Children regularly record their progress in their profiles and in their personal scrapbooks. These clearly show that children are making very good progress. They enjoy sharing their broader interests and achievements with others. Children's work is celebrated and shared in a number of ways. This includes very attractive displays around the school, and in a series of high quality portfolios which depict their experiences. Children participate in a wide range of community events. They have developed a good knowledge of nature through growing vegetables, fruit and herbs. They hold a regular 'Market Garden Day' where they sell their produce and raise significant funds for the school. Children have recently achieved their first Eco-Schools Scotland green flag award. They also achieve very well through celebrating Scottish culture. Some have achieved success in art and poetry competitions through the work of Robert Burns. They take part in traditional Scottish music, perform well on the accordion and with support, are planning to record their own CD. Children are aware of how to keep safe and healthy. Staff make very effective use of the school grounds and the local environment to enhance children's learning. We found that children's writing has improved recently due to the new approaches that are being used. Children are using a wider range of vocabulary, have improved the content of their writing and are now much more aware of the

¹ This is a service for deaf users. Please do not use this number for voice calls as this will not connect.

APPENDIX 3 - ETTRICK PRIMARY SCHOOL INSPECTION REPORT

purpose of their written work. In mathematics and numeracy, children have benefited from a sustained learning activity for their 'Appetite in Action' submission. This has helped them use a range of mathematical knowledge in real life situations. Commendably, your children achieved first prize in this UK wide competition. Your children are very proud of their school and staff are supporting them very well to ensure that they achieve as well as they can.

How well does the school support children to develop and learn?

Staff know their children very well. They give very good support to help children further develop and achieve in all aspects of their learning. Children are engaged in all their learning tasks and they are regularly challenged in their thinking. They are confident when working independently but do seek help if they need it. Teachers and the classroom assistant work very well together to support children's learning. The classroom assistant provides extremely effective and very valuable support to children. Staff regularly discuss your children's learning with them. They help them to set targets and to achieve their next steps. Across the school, staff meet the care and welfare needs of children very well. The school has strong partnerships with parents and the wider community and they in turn support the school very well. Children access a broad range of well-planned and engaging curricular activities. Staff make very good use of the outdoor environment to enhance children's learning. Teachers clearly identify and plan links across learning. They are confident in planning and delivering all aspects of Curriculum for Excellence. Children have good quality experiences in numeracy and literacy across learning. Enterprise activities underpin much of the work of the school and children have organised and planned their 'Market Garden Day', planned and budgeted for their whole school trip to York and continue to recycle and re-use as part of their sustainability plan. The school is keeping parents up to date by issuing the termly curriculum overview letters. Children have planned meetings with their partner school and regularly join together to share their learning. They are making appropriate use of information and communications technology (ICT) across the curriculum.

How well does the school improve the quality of its work?

We are confident that the school can continue to improve its work. The headteacher correctly identified a number of strengths of the school but also indicated some aspects for further improvement. All staff are very committed to improving the guality of children's learning and achievement. They are confident in leading new and innovative approaches to learning to help them achieve this. Staff have rightly identified the need to further involve children and parents in personal learning planning and are taking the lead in this development. The school has an appropriate improvement plan in place but the headteacher now needs to involve staff more in gathering evidence of progress and in measuring improvement overall. Teachers are very reflective practitioners and are keen to continue to improve. Staff are keen to share effective practice across the partner schools and have made a good start to observing one another's work. The headteacher should now be more systematic in monitoring learning across the school. She should give staff more guality feedback about their work to help them to improve even further. Staff have made a start to making the most effective use of ICT in this rural situation, to help them work together on professional development opportunities. The school is very well supported by parents, the Parent Council and the wider rural community. Children are very actively involved in the life and work of the school and their learning is much enhanced by this involvement. The school is very well placed to continue improving the quality of its work.

APPENDIX 3 - ETTRICK PRIMARY SCHOOL INSPECTION REPORT

This inspection of your school found the following key strengths.

- · Highly motivated children who are very keen to learn.
- · The quality of children's learning experiences.
- · The exceptional support given by all staff to help children in their learning.
- · Children's achievements in music and other aspects of expressive arts.
- Use of the outdoors and local environment to support children's learning.
- · Partnership working with parents, the local community, and other schools.

We discussed with staff and the education authority how they might continue to improve the school. This is what we agreed with them.

- · Continue as planned, to involve children and parents more in personal learning planning.
- Further develop monitoring processes and involve staff more in evaluating the work of the school.

What happens at the end of the inspection?

We are satisfied with the overall quality of provision. We are confident that the school's self-evaluation processes are leading to improvements. As a result, we will make no further visits in connection with this inspection. The local authority will inform parents about the school's progress as part of the authority's arrangements for reporting to parents on the quality of its schools.

Isabel Robb HM Inspector

Additional inspection evidence, such as details of the quality indicator evaluations, for your school can be found on the Education Scotland website at http://www.hmie.gov.uk/ViewEstablishment.aspx?id=8663&type=2

Please contact us if you want to know how to get the report in a different format, for example, in a translation. You can contact us at <u>enquiries@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk</u> or write to us at BMCT, Education Scotland, Denholm House, Almondvale Business Park, Almondvale Way, Livingston EH54 6GA.

If you want to give us feedback or make a complaint about our work, please contact 01506 600200, or write to us at the above address or e-mail: feedback@educationscotland.gsi.gov.uk.

APPENDIX 4 - KIRKHOPE PRIMARY SCHOOL LOCATION AND SITE PLANS

KIRKHOPE PRIMARY SCHOOL LOCATION PLAN



KIRKHOPE PRIMARY SCHOOL SITE PLAN



KIRKHOPE NURERY SITE PLAN



APPENDIX 5 - YARROW PRIMARY SCHOOL LOCATION AND SITE PLANS



YARROW PRIMARY SCHOOL LOCATION PLAN

YARROW PRIMARY SCHOOL SITE PLAN



APPENDIX 6 - SPREADSHEET SHOWING CURRENT REVENUE COSTS FOR SCHOOL PROPOSED FOR CLOSURE

Financial Template

Table 1	Column 1	Column 2	Column 3	Column 4
Row 1	Current revenue costs for school proposed for closure			
Row 2	Name of School [enter name of school] Ettrick	Costs for full financial year (projected annual costs)	Additional financial impact on receiving school [enter name of school]	Annual recurring savings (column 2 minus column 3)
Row 3	School costs			
Row 4	Employee costs - note 1			
Row 5	teaching staff	76,594	26,255	50,339
Row 6	support staff	24,113		24,113
Row 7	Teaching staff training (CPD etc.)			
Row 8	support staff training			
Row 9 Row 10	Supply costs - note 2			
Row 11	Building costs:			
Row 12	property insurance	419		419
Row 13	non domestic rates			
Row 14	water & sewerage charges			
Row 15	utilities costs	4,218		4,218
Row 16	cleaning (contract or inhouse)	4,660		4,660
Row 17	building repair & maintenance			
Row 18	grounds maintenance			
Row 19	facilities management costs - note 6	691		691
Row 20	revenue costs arising from capital			
Row 21	other	1,860		1,739
Row 22				
Row 23	School operational costs:			
Row 24	learning materials			
Row 25	catering (contract or inhouse)			
Row 26	SQA costs			
Row 27 Row 28	other school operational costs (e.g. licences)			
Row 29 Row 30	Transport costs: note 3 home to school		note 4	
Row 30	other pupil transport costs			
Row 32		1 646		1,646
Row 33	staff travel SCHOOL COSTS SUB-TOTAL	1,646 114,201		87,825
Row 34	Income			
Row 35				
Row 36 Row 37	Sale of meals			
	Lets			
Row 38	External care provider			
Row 39				
Row 40 Row 41	SCHOOL INCOME SUB-TOTAL			
Row 42	TOTAL COSTS MINUS INCOME FOR SCHOOL			
Row 43		1		
Row 44	UNIT COST PER PUPIL PER YEAR	114,201		

Column 5	
Table 2	
Capital costs	
Capital Life Cycle cost - note 7	
Third party contributions to capital costs	

Table 3		
Annual Property costs incurred (moth-balling) until disposal		
property insurance		
non domestic rates		
water & sewerage charges		
energy costs		
cleaning (contract or inhouse)		
security costs		
building repair & maintenance		
grounds maintenance		
facilities management costs		
other		
TOTAL ANNUAL COST UNTIL DISPOSAL		

Table 4	
	Non-recurring reve

TOTAL NON-RECURRING REVENUE COSTS

Table 5		

Impact on GAE - note 5

GAE IMPACT

Column 6	Column 7
School proposed for closure	Receiving school

enue costs		

Notes

1. The total costs incurred for teaching staff (row 5) and support staff (row 6) are required to be included. Column 2 should include the current costs for a full financial year for the school proposed for closure, and column 3 should include the *additional* cost to the receiving school as a result of staff transferring. For teaching staff, this should include regular teachers, itinerant teachers, learning support teaching staff

and special education (ASN) staff. Itinerant teaching staff includes central support services such as English as additional language support, hearing, visually impaired services, educational psychology services.

For support staff, this should include classroom assistants, administration staff and janitorial staff.

For all staff the costs entered should include salary, NI and pension costs.

If the school proposed for closure has less than 3 staff members, then the cumulative staff costs only should be given in row 5 (for both teaching and support staff), so as to avoid possible disclosure of individual salaries.

Training costs should be identified separately in rows 7 and 8.

2. Supply costs to cover teaching and support staff. This may be held in a central budget, be devolved or shared across the budgets.

3. 'Home to school' pupil transport costs should include those school transport costs incurred in accordance with Council policy. 'Other pupil transport costs' will cover costs incurred for the transport of pupils for activities such as swimming etc

4. Row 30 of column 3 should include the additional transport costs related to the increased home to school transport arrangements that are put in place in accordance with Council policy. This figure is therefore likely to be considerably higher than current costs.

5. This table is to capture the impact on the revenue support grant as a result of changes to GAE. Impact on GAE should consider the issues covered in the GAE section of the guidance document that accompanies this template.

6. Facilities management costs will include costs related to caretakering, janitorial and security.

7. The capital costs for the receiving school should be taken across the life cycle of the school in line with the life expectancy of that school. The capital costs for the school proposed for closure should be taken across the same life cycle period.